

## Say no to golf course: An open letter to the members of Shingkhar Village

To sign the petition, go to:

<http://www.ipetitions.com/petition/say-no-to-golf-course-in-shingkhar/>

*The proposal to create a golf course, reported in Kuensel 23 July 2011, portends the end of Shingkhar as a serene and spiritual valley.*

By Karma Phuntsho



The meadows below holy sites: area for proposed golf course

People who have been to Shingkhar or seen it in films such as *The Perfect Girl* and *The Golden Cup* would clearly remember its rolling ridges, pristine forests, open pastures, clear streams, curious rock faces, sublime shrines, picturesque village and a closely knit community. Shingkhar is a valley we love for its serenity and sacred atmosphere. Saints such as Longchenpa have traversed its wide meadows and narrow footpaths. Shingkhar is, in fact, one of his eight spiritual sanctuaries in Bhutan. What good, then, can a golf course bring to it?

Golf courses require a huge amount of water and enormous quantities of pesticide and herbicides. Even in a tropical country like Thailand, a golf course is said to use as much water as 60,000 rural villagers and over 1500kg of chemical fertilizers in a year. Ecologically, these can lead to major damages to the ecosystem beside turning the valley into a ground for continual 'killing for fun'.

Economically, the project may lure some with the promise of easy cash and economic gain but such promises are often deceptive. After all, the proposal is not for a charitable project but a business venture with vested interests. Unless the village retains a large chunk of ownership or tight control, there is no guarantee that the venture will automatically benefit Shingkhar. In all likelihood, the external investors may bring in their own facilities and staff and take out any profit leaving the villagers only with the dribs and drabs. Beside, golf business is not doing well globally. Even if this one takes off, such success can lead to a serious hike in the prices of property and commodities in the valley, thereby bringing new economic pressures to the locals. It can change the demographic dynamics and much more. Beside, the economic promise of a golf course is only a superficial and prejudiced one as the golf course can put off many more tourists and visitors, who may not be interested in or even hate to see a golf course in the beautiful valley. Can't Shingkhar remain a sacred site of cultural and spiritual attraction as it did so far and not become a golfing destination?

Culturally, if there is one sport which can be associated with the materialist and elitist Western culture, it would be golf. There are many places on the earth suitable for it. Do we need to give it a place in the spiritual heartland of Bhutan? If the golf course is built, there will be serious consequences for the mobility of the local people and their livestock. It will disrupt Shingkhar's pastoral culture and dairy farming. Imagine a large part of the valley cordoned off for the use of golfers, with no people and animal allowed to pass through it freely. Imagine what sore sight it can be for the hermits of Shamzur and Garkhai who meditate above the meadows.

Your Excellency, Home Minister and other members of Shingkhar village, I am neither against golf nor against the investors; I do not even know who they are. However, with Shingkhar's long term ecological, economic, cultural and spiritual concerns in my heart, I write this letter to you persuading you to reject the proposal to build a golf course in your valley of exquisite nature and rich spiritual heritage and history. I request you to remain firm and united in stopping the golf course and preserving Shingkhar's pastoral beauty and spiritual blessings for, in the long run, these qualities will prove to be Shingkhar's main source of happiness.

Dr Karma Phuntsho  
Ura and Cambridge

# གོལཔ་ཚེ་ཐང་བཀག་པའི་སྐུལ་མ།

ཀམ་ཕུན་ཚོགས་ནས་ཤིང་མཁར་མི་དམངས་ལུ་ཕུལ་པའི་འབྲམས་ཡིག།

སྤྱི་ལོ་ ༢༠༡༡ ཟླ་བ་ ༧ པའི་ཚེས་ ༢༩ གི་ཀུན་གསལ་གསར་ཤོག་ནང་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུ་གོལཔ་ཚེ་ཐང་བཟོ་ནིའི་གནས་ཚུལ་བཀོད་ཡོད་པ་འདི་ནི་ཤིང་མཁར་གི་ཡུལ་ལྗོངས་སྤྱི་དྲོག་ཏེ་དེ་མེད་པ་འགྲོ་ནིའི་སྐུ་ལྟས་བཟུམ་སྤྱོད་ཚོར་མ་མས། དེ་ཡང་ཤིང་མཁར་གི་ཡུལ་ལྗོངས་དེ། ཉམས་དགའ་བའི་རི་བརྒྱུད། རང་བཞིན་གི་ནགས་ཚལ། བསེལ་ཞིང་དུངས་བའི་ཚུ་ཕུན། ཡ་མཚན་ཆེ་བའི་བྲག་རྩོ། དད་པ་སྐྱེ་སའི་རྟེན། ཡིད་དུ་འོང་བའི་གོང་ཡུལ། བཙེ་ཞིང་མཐུན་པའི་མི་སྡེ་ཚུ་དང་ལྷན་གཅིག་སྤྱོད་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུ་ལྟོད་མི་ཚུ་དང་། དེ་མེན་སྤོག་བརྒྱན་སུ་ཏྲིག་འཁྲིའི་དང་གསེར་གི་ཕོར་པ་ལྟ་མི་ཚུ་གིས་ཡང་ཆ་བཞག་པ་ཨིན། ཡུལ་ལྗོངས་གི་བཀོད་པ་མཛེས་ཤིང་བྱིན་ཆགས་པ་ལུ་མི་ཚུ་གིས་དགའ་མ་ཚད། ཀུན་མཁྱེན་གྲོང་ཆེན་པ་གིས་གཙོས་པའི་རྒྱལ་བ་གོང་མ་ལེ་ཤ་གིས་ཤིང་མཁར་གི་སྤང་གཤོང་ཡངས་དྲག་དང་ལམ་འཕྲང་དོག་ལ་ཚུ་ཞབས་གིས་བཅག་ཏེ་བྱིན་གིས་བརྒྱབས་ཡོད་པའི་ཁར། ཤིང་མཁར་བདེ་ཆེན་གླིང་དེ་འབྲུག་ལུ་ཀུན་མཁྱེན་གྲོང་ཆེན་རབ་འབྲམས་གི་གླིང་བརྒྱུད་ཡོད་པའི་ནང་གསེས་གཅིག་ཨིན། དེ་འབད་མཁར་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུ་གོལཔ་ཚེ་ཐང་གཅིག་བཙུགས་དགོཔ་འདུག་ག་?

མཐའ་འཁོར་གནས་སྤངས་གི་སྐྱོལ་ས་བཟུ་བ་ཅིན། གོལཔ་ཚེ་ཐང་ཚུ་ལུ་ཚུ་དང་། འབྲུག་དང་རྩ་བས་ད་ནིའི་སྤོན་ལུད་འཁོར་ཆེན་སྤེ་བཏབ་དགོ། དེ་ཡང་ཐའི་ལན་ལྷན་བཟུམ་མའི་རྒྱལ་ཁབ་ཆར་ཚུ་འཁོལ་ས་ལུ་ཡང་གོལཔ་ཚེ་ཐང་གཅིག་ནང་རང་ལོ་གཅིག་ལུ་ཚུ་ ཡུལ་མི་༦༠༠༠༠་གིས་སྤྱོད་པ་ལས་ལྷག་པ་དང་། སྤོན་ལུད་ཀེ་ལྷིད་༡༥༠༠་ལྷག་པ་སྤེ་དགོ་དོ་ཡོད་ཨིན་མས། ཚུ་དང་ལུད་ལག་ལེན་ཐབས་ཐངས་དེ་བཟུམ་གིས་མ་འོངས་པར་ཡུལ་གི་རང་བཞིན་གནས་སྤངས་ལུ་གཞོན་པ་བསྐྱེལ་བའི་ཁར་འབྲུག་བས་ད་ནིའི་སྤོན་ལུད་ལྷན་བཏབ་ད་ལུ་ས་ཆ་དེ་ཚེད་མེའི་དོན་ལུ་སེམས་ཅན་མང་རབས་ཅིག་སྤོག་གཙོད་འབད་ས་ལུ་འགྱུར་འོང།

རྒྱ་དཔལ་འབྱོར་གི་སྐྱོལ་ས་མནོ་བསམ་བཏང་པ་ད། མི་ལ་ལུ་དདུལ་གི་ཐོབ་ལམ་འཇམ་ཏོང་ཏོང་དཔལ་འབྱོར་གི་ལེ་ཕན་ཐོབ་ནིའི་རེ་བ་སྐྱེས་ཡོད་པ་སྤིད་རུང་། དེ་བཟུམ་མའི་རེ་བ་དེ་འགྲུབ་པ་ལ་ཁག་ཨིན། དང་མ་ཅིག་ལུ་ཚེ་ཐང་གི་འཆར་གཞི་དེ་ཚོང་གི་གོ་སྐབས་འཚོལ་མ་གཏོགས་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུ་ཕན་པའི་མི་སྡེ་ཞབས་ཏྲིག་ལས་འགུལ་གཅིག་མེན་སྤེ། ཚོང་ལུ་འདི་བཟུམ་ནང་ཤིང་མཁར་གཡུས་ཚན་ལུ་བདག་དབང་མང་ཤོས་དང་དབང་ཚད་ཆེ་ཤོས་ཡོད་ན་མ་

གཏོགས་འདི་གིས་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུ་བརྟན་བརྟན་པན་ཐོག་པའི་ངེས་པ་རྩ་ལས་མེད། འབད་ར་འབདན་ཕྱི་ཁའི་ཚོང་  
བཅུགས་མི་དེ་གིས་ཚོང་ལུ་མཁོ་བའི་ཅ་ཆས་དང་ལཱ་གཡོགས་ཚུ་ཕྱི་ཁ་ལས་ནང་ན་འབྱིད་འོང་། ཁེབ་སང་ཐོབ་ཚད་ནང་  
ན་ལས་ཕྱི་ཁར་འབག་འགྲོ་སྟེ་ཤིང་མཁར་གྱི་མི་ཚུ་བྱ་བུ་བྱ་བུ་ལས་མ་ཐོབ་པར་ལུས་ནི་ཉེན་ཁ་ཡོད། ད་རེ་ནང་པ་  
གོལས་གི་ཚོང་བསྐྱར་འདི་འཇམ་གླིང་ནང་རང་མར་བབ་སོང་སྟེ་ཡོད། ག་དེ་ཅི་སྟེ་ཚོང་དེ་ལེགས་ཤོམ་འགྲོ་བུང་། དེ་ལུ་  
བརྟན་ཏེ་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུང་པར་ས་དང་ཅ་ཆས་སོགས་ཀྱི་རིན་གོང་ཡར་སང་འགྲོ་སྟེ་ལུང་པའི་མི་ཚུ་ལུ་དབུལ་གྱི་སྐབས་  
མ་བདེ་མ་གསལ་པ་འཕོན། མི་སྡེ་འི་རིམ་པ་ཚུ་འབྲུགས་ནི་ལ་སོགས་པ་འབྱུང་བ་ལེ་ཤེས་ཤོད་། དེ་གིས་མ་དོ་བ། ཚུ་ཐང་  
ལུ་བརྟན་ཏེ་དཔལ་འབྱོར་ཡར་རྒྱས་འགྲོ་བའི་རེ་བ་འདི་ལེགས་ཤོམ་སྟེ་ཞིབ་དབུད་འབད་བ་ཅིན་འཇོལ་བ་སྟེ་མཐོང་  
མས། དེ་ཡང་ཡུལ་སྡེ་ངས་ནང་ཚུ་ཐང་དེ་སྟེ་བ་ཅིན་ཚུ་མོ་ལུ་དགའ་མི་དག་པ་ཅིག་འོང་བུང་། རྒྱ་ཆེ་ཕྱི་རྒྱལ་བཟུ་  
བཤལ་བ་དང་གནས་སྐོར་བ་ཚུ་མོ་འདི་ལུ་སྟོབ་མེད་མི་དང་མ་དགའ་མི་ཚུ་ག་ར་ཤིང་མཁར་ལུ་མ་འོང་པར་སྟོད་  
འོང་། དེ་འབད་མ་ལས་དཔལ་འབྱོར་གྱི་དོན་ལུ་ཡང་ཤིང་མཁར་གཡུས་དེ་གོལས་ཚུ་ས་བཟོམ་ལས་སྲུང་བཟུམ་སྟེ་ཚོས་  
དང་ལམ་སྟོལ་གྱི་བརྟེན་གནས་བྱིན་ཅན་གཅིག་སྟེ་བཞག་ན་མི་བྲག་ག་?

ལམ་སྟོལ་གི་ཁ་ཐུག་ལས་མཉོ་བསམ་བཏང་ན། གོལས་ཀྱི་ཚུད་མ་འདི་འཇམ་གླིང་ལུ་བཅུགས་ཀྱི་རྒྱ་ལོར་དོས་པོ་  
གཙོར་བཏོན་འབད་ནི་དང་བྲག་འདོད་བཏོན་པའི་ཚུད་མ་གཅིག་ཨིན། དེ་ཚུ་ས་བཏུབ་པའི་ཡུལ་དང་ས་ཆ་འཇམ་གླིང་ནང་  
ལེ་ཤེ་ཅིག་བཞག་སྟེ་འབྲུག་རྒྱལ་ཁབ་ཀྱི་ཚོས་ཀྱི་མཐིལ་ལུ་རང་བརྒྱབ་དགོ་ག་? ཚུ་ཐང་བརྒྱབ་པ་ཅིན་ས་གནས་དེའི་  
མི་དང་ལོར་སེམས་ཅན་ཚུ་མར་ཚུར་འགྲོ་ནི་ཡང་བཀག་བརྒྱབ་སྟེ་ཡུལ་གྱི་སྟོན་སེམས་ཅན་ལུ་བརྟན་པའི་འཚོ་བ་དང་  
ལམ་སྟོལ་ཚུ་ཉམས་འགྲོ་འོང་། བ་མེས་ལས་བརྒྱད་པའི་སྤང་ཐང་རྩ་འགྲོག་དགའ་ཤོས་གཅིག་གོལས་ཚུ་ཐང་བཟོ་སྟེ་  
ཤིང་མཁར་གྱི་མི་དང་སེམས་ཅན་ཡང་རང་དབང་སྟེ་འབྲུམས་ནི་མེད་པར་ཕྱི་ཁའི་མི་གཞན་གྱིས་དམ་འཇོན་འབད་བ་  
ཅིན་སེམས་ཁར་ག་དེ་སྟེ་ཚོར་འོང་། ཤམ་བྱུར་དང་གར་ཁའི་དགོན་པ་ལུ་བཅུགས་དམ་གནང་བའི་མཚམས་པ་ཚུ་དང་  
ཡུལ་ལྷ་གཞི་བདག་ཚུལ་ཡང་གོལས་ཚུ་མི་ཚུ་གཟིགས་པ་ད་བཅུགས་མི་དགེས་མཉོམ་མས།

མི་རྗེ་ནང་སྲིད་སྟོན་པོས་གཙོས་པའི་ཤིང་མཁར་མི་དམངས་ལུ་གུས་ཐུན་ར་གིས་ཉིང་ལས་ལུ་དོན། ད་གོལས་ཚུ་མོ་ལུ་  
མ་དགའ་མ་ཡང་མེན། ཚོང་བཅུགས་མི་དང་མ་མཐུན་མ་ཡང་མེད། འཆར་གཞི་བཀའ་མི་དང་ཚོང་བཅུགས་མི་ག་ཨིན་  
ཡང་མི་ཤེས་ལགས། ཨིན་བུང་ཤིང་མཁར་གྱི་མ་འོངས་པའི་མཐའ་འཁོར་གནས་སྤངས། དཔལ་འབྱོར་ལེགས་  
ཉེས། སྟོལ་བཟང་དང་སངས་རྒྱས་བསྟན་པའི་བདེ་ཐབས་སེམས་ཁར་བཞག་སྟེ། ཤིང་མཁར་གྱི་མི་སེར་ཡོངས་ལུ། དེ་

རེ་ཁྲོད་ཀྱི་རང་བཞིན་ཡིད་དུ་འོང་བའི་ཡུལ་སྡེ་དང་། ཚོས་ཀྱི་སྲོལ་རྒྱུན་དང་ལྡན་པ་དེ་ལུ་གོ་ལས་ཅེ་ཐང་བཟོ་ནིའི་འཆར་  
གཞི་དེ་ངོས་ལེན་མ་གནང་པར་བཀོ་བཞག་སྟེ། ཐུགས་གཅིག་འདྲེས་དང་གསུང་གཅིག་མཐུན་གྱི་སློ་ལས་ཅེ་ཐང་དེ་  
བཀག་སྟེ། ཤིང་མཁར་གྱི་ཕུག་གི་བདེ་ཐབས་ལུ་ཕན་པའི་འཁོར་ཡུལ་གི་མཛེས་ཉམས་དང་ཚོས་ཀྱི་བྱིན་རླབས་ཉམས་  
མ་བཅུག་པར་སྲུང་སྐྱོབ་ཅི་དྲག་གང་དྲག་མཛད་གནང་ཟེར་ཞུ་བ་མཁྱེན་མཁྱེན་མཁྱེན་ལགས། ཞེས་ཞུ་ར་དང་ཀེམ་  
བི་རིང་གཙུག་ལག་སློབ་ཁང་དུ་གནས་པའི་ཐ་གལ་བ་ཀམ་ཕུན་ཚོགས་ནས་སྟེ་ ༢༠༡༡ ལྷོ་ ༧ པའི་ཚེས་ ༡༧ལ་

ཐུལ།།

འབྲམས་ཡིག་འདི་ལུ་རྒྱབ་སྐྱོར་མཛད་པ་ཅིན་འོག་གི་དྲ་བའི་ཁ་བྱང་ཐོག་མཚན་རྟགས་བཀོད་གནང་།

<http://www.ipetitions.com/petition/say-no-to-golf-course-in-shingkhar/>

## Signatures

1. Name: Ulrike Cokl on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: As someone who deeply respects and appreciates the people of Ura and Shingkar I absolutely agree with Dr. Karma Phuntsho. There is evidence in academic literature (based on case studies from all over the world) that golf courses in areas where land is already scarce, can cause a lot of stress to environment but also to local cultures. Bhutan's GNH-approach is unique, and I think such projects should be carefully examined to see if they are in accordance with the 4 pillars. I also think that there are other forms of tourism which could prove more integrated and benefitting for the Shingkarpa. Golf is indeed a symbol for materialist and elitist Western culture (as pointed out above) and thus a golf course seems a bit out of place next to the traditional village life of Shingkar. For the same reason and the ones mentioned by the author I also doubt the economic benefit for the villagers in the long run.

---
2. Name: Pema Gyamtsho on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: Please drop the plans considering the great impact it will bring to local biodiversity and environment.

---
3. Name: Anthony Aris on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: Having visited Shingkar last November, I can testify that it is one of the most beautiful and unspoilt valleys in Bhutan. I have witnessed many desecrations caused by golf courses throughout the world. I urge the authorities in Bhutan to forbid this wholly materialistic development.

---
4. Name: Tardy Anne on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: It is crucial to preserve the natural beauty and spiritual heritage of this beautiful valley, in the heart of Bhutan, emblematic of the Bhutanese values and identity.  
Please reject the proposal to build a golf course in such a unique and very precious site.  
Thank you from heart!

---
5. Name: Kunzang on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:

---
6. Name: Sangay Jamtsho on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: It would be worthwhile to consider how well a golf course fits into the GNH policy, particularly in terms of the two pillars of environmental conservation & cultural preservation in Shingkar's case.

---
7. Name: Marlene Kurz on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:

---
8. Name: Roderick Aris on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I think Dr. Karma Phuntsho's points are clear and valid. What will draw people to Bhutan is that fact that it is so well preserved, there is no place like it on Earth that I know of and adding a golf course will surely be detrimental to it's unique heritage. If the golf course goes ahead what will come next. A McDonald's? A Starbucks? No one needs another golf course.

---
9. Name: Kuenga Wangmo on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: As Dr. Karma points out, the negative impacts that a golf course - catered to tourists and the rich - could have on the ecology, social and cultural well being of Shingkar need to fully be appreciated before such a project is approved. It is a beautiful spiritual place for us all - let Shingkar be!

---
10. Name: Gill Farrer-Halls on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: Please reconsider proceeding with the golf course and preserve the fragile ecology of this precious terrain.

---
11. Name: Pema Thinley on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:

---
12. Name: Dr Richard W Whitecross on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I am very deeply concerned by this proposal and would ask that the environmental harm caused by golf courses is fully considered. Dr Karma Phuntsho rightly highlights the implications on local habitats, especially from the use of chemical fertilisers that will have irreversible effects on the local soil and watercourses.

From a cultural perspective, Shingkar valley is an important part of local and national culture. To willfully destroy a beautiful, spiritual valley will strike at the heart of Bhutanese culture and values. I would respectfully ask your Excellency to consider and support Dr Phuntsho's petition.

---

13. Name: Geoffrey Samuel on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I believe that this would be a most unfortunate development, and one wholly out of keeping with what Bhutan has come to represent within today's world. It would also be a bad precedent that would help to legitimate further inappropriate and destructive changes. There are all too many examples around the world of the damaging impact of developments of this kind. Bhutan is very fortunate in having been largely spared so far.
- 
14. Name: Francoise Tashi Om on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: totally opposed to this idea which privileges money over culture and way of life  
this is an appalling project and it is shocking
- 
15. Name: Linda Leaming on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
16. Name: Stephan Kloos on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
17. Name: Karma Tshering on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I am also against this crazy idea of turning a sacred site into a golfing destination. Are we not going against the ideology of GNH? There should have been a proper analysis/research done between "the preservation of our Culture and environment", & "the introduction of Western culture" in a valley of rich spiritual heritage and history. Which one is more important in the long run?  
Should the hermits meditating above the meadows of Shingkar move from there?  
If Bhutan is really to have another golf course, why not it be proposed in the southern part of Bhutan? Gelephu would be a perfect place to build a golf course.  
Therefore, I strongly support Dr. Karma Phuntsho in stopping the golf course and preserving Shingkar as a sacred site of cultural and spiritual destination but not a golfing destination.  
Karma Tshering  
(Filmmaker)  
from Chhokhor valley in Bumthang.
- 
18. Name: E. Werner Külling. Former Secretary General Helvetas Switzerland And Resident Coordinator In Bhutan . on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: Dear Dr. Karma Phuntsho,  
I fully support your opposition against the golf course in Shingkar. It would really be a disaster if such a project comes through. We already have to many of them in Switzerland. You will have my full support. Please keep in contact!  
E. Werner Külling
- 
19. Name: Michael Stanley-Baker on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
20. Name: Karma Tshering on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I am also against this crazy idea of turning a sacred site into a golfing destination. Are we not going against the ideology of GNH? There should have been a proper analysis/research done between "the preservation of our Culture and environment", & "the introduction of Western culture" in a valley of rich spiritual heritage and history. Which one is more important in the long run?  
Should the hermits meditating above the meadows of Shingkar move from there?  
If Bhutan is really to have another golf course, why not it be proposed in the southern part of Bhutan? Gelephu would be a perfect place to build a golf course.  
Therefore, I strongly support Dr. Karma Phuntsho in stopping the golf course and preserving Shingkar as a sacred site of cultural and spiritual destination but not a golfing destination.  
Karma Tshering  
(Filmmaker)  
from Chhokhor valley in Bumthang.
- 
21. Name: Dechen Wangmo Roder on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
22. Name: Kathleen Zurich Fung on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I agree with your comments one-hundred percent.

Bhutan needs to cherish and preserve its spiritual traditions and protect its pristine environment. This golf course would disrupt the culture and damage the landscape forever.

Yours in Travel,  
Kathleen Fung  
Far Fung Places LLC

- 
23. Name: Yeshi Eudon on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
24. Name: Robert Mayer on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
25. Name: Karma Rigzin on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I would love to see your petition taken into consideration la.
- 
26. Name: Tshering Pelzom on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
27. Name: Rigtsal Dorji on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
28. Name: Chelsea Robles on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
29. Name: Lama Thinley on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I strongly supports it.....
- 
30. Name: Christian K. Wedemeyer on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
31. Name: Tashi Gyeltshen on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
32. Name: Dr Cathy Cantwell on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
33. Name: A Maki on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: Having visited Shingkar only three weeks ago, I must agree with Dr. Phuntsho's keen observations regarding his home region and voice opposition to any proposal that would encourage or allow a golf course to be built there. There are already two golf courses in Bhutan, in Haa and Thimphu, and as such there is little justification for putting unnecessary strains both on the environment and local population of Shingkar. It is my request that the concerned authorities reflect deeply on the potential ramifications of a golf course for this community, recall the region's rich cultural significance, and consider the project in light of the core motivations for national development policy so admired outside of Bhutan. Please reject the proposed Shingkar golf course for the benefit of all who live and visit there.
- 
34. Name: Doris Maran on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
35. Name: Jigme T on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: NO
- 
36. Name: Anonymous on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
37. Name: Lektsho Dorji on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
-



38. Name: Anastasia Nurre on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
39. Name: Stephanie Guyer-stevens on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
40. Name: Marina Beck on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
41. Name: Dawa on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: I completely agree with Dr karma's view. A golf course can only spoil the beauty of Shingkar village. A golf course is going to be counter productive to all parties involved (the investor, the villagers and the tourists ) There are many beautiful & well equipped golf courses around the world. If the investor is targeting tourists to play golf in Bhutan it will be difficult considering the average age of tourists visiting Bhutan and also the investor will not be able to match the facilities he can provide to the tourists compared to other golf courses! This will also stop free movement of local villagers to use their pasture lands. I hope the people in Shingkar will stand together to stop this happening.
- 
42. Name: Anonymous on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: Taking into account the ecological, cultural and spiritual concerns described above I wish to support this petition to maintain the calm and quiet beauty of the valley. I therefore register my objection to the proposal for a golf course in Shingkar.
- 
43. Name: Bryan Phillips on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments: The Shingkar area is one of Bhutan's most gorgeous and special open places. The religious heritage of the area is paramount and I believe it would be extremely inauspicious to create a golf course there.
- 
44. Name: Tenzin Dendup on Jul 26, 2011  
Comments:
- 
45. Name: Tshewang R. Wangchuk on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: Money over everything else - we are going wrong somewhere. Why should a community lose out to a small group of people who enjoy an elitist western sport? Nothing wrong with golf, but Shingkar mustn't suffer due to that. Ultimately, the Shingkar must have the final say in this. Given the ecological and social impact that a golf course would bring, I would hope that any sensible person would oppose this proposal. As a concerned Bhutanese I am vehemently opposed to this idea. However, the Shingkar must have the final say on something that is proposed in their community.
- 
46. Name: Andrea Williams on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: Please resist the temptation of foreign attention and investment. Pass on turning this sacred valley into a playground for a tiny number of non-locals who may visit only once. Even tourists don't want to see this happen. The construction of a golf course requires large-scale irreversible destruction and it absorbs huge amounts of resources. I have been to Shingkar only once but given the small size of the village, the relative scale of a golf course in the area seems bizarrely out of proportion.
- 
47. Name: Jacob Penchansky on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
48. Name: Claudia Trapp on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: This does not seem in alignment with other Bhutanese goals and harmony with the environment.
- 
49. Name: V. Joan Campbell on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: Surely you don't want to sacrifice what is unique to Bhutan, only to turn it into a standard "resort" destination - something to be found anywhere in the world. Please don't trash both your culture and your environment!
- 
50. Name: Anonymous on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
51. Name: Kristel Josel on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
52. Name: Denise M. Glover, PhD on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:

- 
53. Name: Jigme Thinley on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
54. Name: Sangay Choengying Thinley on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
55. Name: Chamu Kuppuswamy on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
56. Name: Karma Jigme on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: So far Bhutan has managed to conserve valued natural heritage despite pressure from economic development, which no other countries could resist - thanks to our visionary leaders. In times to come, when people are tired of artificially created environments, these undisturbed natural environments (many heavenly places like Shingkar) will be an attraction to international tourists and source of happiness to Bhutanese. Please save our national treasure – our pride.
- 
57. Name: Anonymous on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
58. Name: Sonam Tobgay on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: No to golf course in Shingkar.
- 
59. Name: Phuntsho Gyaltsen on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: thank you so much dr. karma phuntsho for the letter. i felt so disturbed after reading the news about the proposed golf course in Shingkar. i'm so relieved that you spoke even my voice.
- 
60. Name: Charlotte Furth on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: When I visited Bhutan, including Bunthang, in 2010, what impressed me most was the simplicity and beauty of a country without heavy commercialiaation but also without most of the visible signs of misery we find accompanying capitalist development else where. Buddhism seemed alive here. The place is unique. Try to keep it that way. There are golf courses all over the world. We dont need more.
- 
61. Name: Phuntsho Choden on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
62. Name: Gerard Tardy on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I happen to be a frequent visitor ( over 10 visits so far) and a friend of Bhutan. . I strongly believe that in order to preserve its unique identity and values ,Bhutan has to make some courageous choices . Rejecting the building of a golf course in the exquisite valley of Shingkar which I was fortunate to visit last year should be on of those courageous choices..
- 
63. Name: Dolma Roder on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
64. Name: Mohammad Nasir Ahmad on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: thats very horrible act to be done i strongly oppose this act. please remain the beauty as it is present. i support against this golf course.
- 
65. Name: Marie Laure Aris on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: why to destroy an unspoilt valley in Bhutan.
- 
66. Name: Tshering Dolkar on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I'm not a resident of Shingkar or Bumthang Dzongkhag, however, I can empathize and understand the consequences of the golf course to the locality and its people and also in the context of GNH.
- 
67. Name: Suzanne Cahill on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
-

68. Name: Tsering Om on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
69. Name: Anonymous on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: Leave shingkar natural at least for gods sake. Lets not get too much tempted by the MONEY, and lets not forget that we live in a globally recognized GNH country....Lets respect those pillars of GNH.  
  
No golf course at Shingkar
- 
70. Name: Dr. Dorjee Raptan Neshar on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I fully support this petition to save the pristine beauty of Shingkar village from the dirt of modern materialistic and wasteful golf- course. This project to serve only the vested interest may temporarily bring some cash benefit to few locals, but the ecological and cultural destruction that will follow will be too costly and heart breaking not only for the people of Bhutan but for all the nature loving people across the world. May some better sense prevail for those investors. &quot;OM MANI PADME HUN&quot;
- 
71. Name: Anonymous on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I strongly agree! Please, no golf course in Shingkar village.  
  
Your Excellency, Home Minister and other members of Shingkar village, I am neither against golf nor against the investors; I do not even know who they are. However, with Shingkar's long term ecological, economic, cultural and spiritual concerns in my heart, I write this letter to you persuading you to reject the proposal to build a golf course in your valley of exquisite nature and rich spiritual heritage and history. I request you to remain firm and united in stopping the golf course and preserving Shingkar's pastoral beauty and spiritual blessings for, in the long run, these qualities will prove to be Shingkar's main source of happiness.
- 
72. Name: John Wehrheim on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: What possible GNH outcome could a golf course in Shingkar possibly bring? Non that I could think of. Please don't waste the precious life of this land.
- 
73. Name: Gabriele Tautscher on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: Mr. Karma Ura very well describes the negative impact of an estrange Golf Course on future local cultural developement in Shingkar.  
I ask the authorities of Bhutan to reconsider their plan in agreement to their unique GNH - instead of a golf course new PUBLIC facilites which too promote tourism.
- 
74. Name: Sherab Jamtsho on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I have my support for the petition. Such activities will cause taking advantage of village naivety. The economic development and employment that they might justify would hardly do any good if not bad in the long run for the locality . I would also like to show my appreciation to Dasho Karma Ura, Dr. Karma Phuntsho and all who are associated for showing concern, bringing up it to our notice and indeed for taking lead. Thanking you. .
- 
75. Name: Sienna Craig on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
76. Name: Chhimi Dem on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
77. Name: Tshering Dorji on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
78. Name: Norden Wangchuk on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
79. Name: Claudia Lingner on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
80. Name: Tshering on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: i am in taiwan and am not ablr to believe the popularity of our country seriously,the topic of having gulf course is all over and everyday i have to answer to many people here they are laughing at us,and it is sush a shameful thing respond. please people of bhutan DONT LET IT HAPPEN.
-

81. Name: D. Wangchuk on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: Dr. Karma Phuntsho has reflected well on the issue and I think, too, that the Bhutanese land and culture would be better off without golf courses.
- 
82. Name: Theresia Hofer on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I fully support Dr Karma Phuntso's petition against the set up of a golf course in Shinkhar, Bumthang, Bhutan. This would certainly have major negative consequences for the local geographical and spiritual landscape and the people. But also for me as a foreigner, I would much prefer to see Bumthang without a golf course, as I have in 2001. Bhutan has so powerfully shown, that it does not need to copy everything that has become normalized elsewhere. This is another chance and, I believe, necessity for Bhutan to take its own course.
- 
83. Name: Pema Wangdi on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: This will kill both the local habitat and the inhabitants.
- 
84. Name: Professor Christine Hogan on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I fully support Dr Karma Phuntsho's points.
- Best Regards
- Dr Christine Hogan
- 
85. Name: Ugen Choden on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
86. Name: Volker Schmidt on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments:
- 
87. Name: Patti on Jul 27, 2011  
Comments: I request that you reconsider building the golf course and maintain the cultural, spiritual and economic heritage of this beautiful area.  
With deep respect,  
Patti
- 
88. Name: Padmavathy Kuppuswamy on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: i whole heartedly support your petition and wish all success in this endeavour.
- 
89. Name: Sonam Wangchuk on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I have served in Thrumshingla National Park for almost 8 years of my conservation career, and Shingkar was one of the villages frequently found on my list of visits during those years. My attraction to that village was the serenity and sanctity, and the surrounding ecosystem primarily constituting of the old growth Himalayan Fir (*Abies densa*) which provided refuge to many endangered species chiefly the red panda (*Ailurus fulgens*) and the Himalayan tragopan (*Tragopan satyra*). So, I absolutely agree with Dr. Karma Phuntsho and other reviewers that there are other forms of tourism which could prove more integrated and beneficial to the Shinkaraps than a golf course.
- 
90. Name: Dr Alex McKay on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I totally concur with Dr Karma Phuntsho's comments; a golf course will have a severe environmental impact on Shingkar, disrupt traditional patterns of grazing and of life, reduce its appeal to the great majority of tourists and bring very little if any benefit to local people.
- 
91. Name: T. Vidnes on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
92. Name: Sarah Johnson on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
93. Name: Lhendup Tharchen on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Leave shingkar natural at least for gods sake. Lets not get too much tempted by the MONEY, and lets not forget that we live in a globally recognized GNH country....Lets respect those pillars of GNH.  
No golf course at Shingkar

- 
94. Name: Kinley Gyeltshen on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I think we should not let this things to happen as it will destroy not just our natural and cultural heritage, but our environment also. This is going to have long term negative impact to our local communities. I hope this things do not materilize it.
- 
95. Name: Anonymous on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
96. Name: Kunzang Choden on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
97. Name: Keathz on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: As human being we have the chance to enjoy all that nature has to offer. We can either decide to nurture it to our own benefit or destroy it. If we decide to preserve the environment, or nature for that matter, we make it better for the future generation. On the other hand, if we cut trees and destroy water catchment areas and turn that beautiful areas to any other reasons which is not very necessary then we are creating problems for future generations. I say NO to the idea of building a golf course in that beautiful valley.
- 
98. Name: Anonymous on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
99. Name: Alejandro Chaoul on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Please keep Bhutan pristine, in its culture and ecologically. There are very few jewels like it remaining in the world today.
- 
100. Name: Dorji Uden on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I agree with Dr.karma phuntsho and others and really support them.so lets say nos to golf course in the beautiful holy valley
- 
101. Name: Choki Wangmo on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I say no to the proposal to create golf course in Shingkhara...Shingkhara is one the spiritual and sacred places in Bhutan, great saints have visited shingkhara centuries back and it is known for its spirituality and peacefulness..We don't want people to destroy it....let's all of us come together and raise our voice...&quot;SAY NO TO GOLF COURSE&quot;...
- 
102. Name: Anonymous on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
103. Name: Phurba Lhendup on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I cannot imagine destroying this natural beauty by greedy people
- 
104. Name: Anonymous on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
105. Name: Zara Fleming on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Shingkhara is a beautiful place, important both culturally and spiritually. To build a golf course here would ruin the sanctity of the area and not necessarily benefit the local people. I regularly bring groups of tourists to Bhutan, who love the unspoiled beauty of this sacred landscape. Please please reconsider this proposal.
- 
106. Name: Dorji Tashi on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Dear readers, allow me to supplement on the wonderful views expressed by Dr Karma Phuntsho and Dasho Karma Ura. I strongly hold up their statement in saying absolute no to the golf course proposal at Shingkhara valley, a place which was blessed by highly regarded Buddhist scholars and has been a noticeable ecstasy for all leaving creatures ranging from hermits, cow herders and other leaving creatures.  
I have had the feeling from my first visit to this valley that the shingkhara valley, slightly secluded from Ura village by a rugged hills, has the natural charisma not only for the tourist but for all leaving creatures and I have no doubt that this will atomically convert to become a source of joyfulness not just for the local community but for every single visitors.  
Although the project might fetch in some positive economic impact, that in anyways, cannot substitute the value it has for the local people today and for the years to come. The entire valley has been a productive pastureland for the local community and an elegant natural ornament in the eyes of the local people and every visitor for which people from that village wear pride to introduce, "I am from Ura, Shingkhara".  
I would reiterate plea of (two) Karmas and join them to humbly request the concern authorities not to pass through the proposal

solely for the benefit of the local people which directly contributes to the country's natural asset.  
Who would you like to vote for, potential golfers or the local community who have lived there centuries ago?

---

107. Name: Gaki Tshomo ( Shingharpa) on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I am no no no to this nasty proposal....We don't want people to destroy the beauty of the most peaceful sacred village 'Shinghar'...let's all of join our hands and cooperate to keep our village as it is...remember "beauty is joy forever"...let it remain beautiful and calm...
- 
108. Name: Julie Hayhoe on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I wholeheartedly endorse Dr Karma Phuntso's concerns for the long term integrity of the Shinghar Valley
- 
109. Name: Gwyneth Anderton on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I heartily endorse the sentiments in this eloquent letter.  
Even if this golf course attracted world events, bringing in participants, trainers, and spectators they would want very expensive accommodation and probably an airport to serve their needs..... not the needs of Bhutanese people who live in the valley.
- Melbourne has just realised that having the Grand Prix motor race here is costing the taxpayer \$40million a year... The expense of hosting it was not offset by an increase of business in the State and certainly did not provide a surplus of income.
- Do not allow outsiders to make 'investments' of this sort in your country. Whatever they tell you they are only thinking of their own profits.  
Its a form of colonisation of your beautiful country.  
Gwyneth Anderton
- 
110. Name: Tshering Palden on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I support the move and feel it necessary for the government to reconsider.
- 
111. Name: Jacqueline McLeod on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Please maintain Bhutan's high standards of ecological care and save this beautiful valley. Also the water wastage and use of pesticides required for the golf course is a significant retrograde step
- 
112. Name: Wim Van Spengen on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
113. Name: Dechen Yeshi on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
114. Name: Christopher Wood on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
115. Name: Jill Greenwell on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: "Gross national happiness" represents a unique approach to productivity and profit. Bhutan is attempting the difficult balance between greater economic prosperity and yet retaining an essentially Bhutanese culture and spirituality.  
A golf course in the heartland on Bhutanese Buddhism would completely upset this balance. May the black cranes fly. Not golf balls.
- 
116. Name: Tshelthrim Wangyal on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I go for no such things at Shinghar
- 
117. Name: Nawang Gyeltshen on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Amid the lessons and lectures in environment and conservation classes abroad; we had to deliver country presentations. I always claimed, "In Bhutan government places highest consideration to conservation, in fact policies are oriented in such a way that economic development will not take place at the cost of environment. Our visionary leaders commanded that environment conservation comes first and then the economic benefits." I am heading for further studies soon again. I am just worried how I would begin my class presentation the next time.
- The concerned agencies have reversed our policies gifted by an Environment Champion, our very own Fourth Druk Gyalpo. Few years ago, I found a golf ball near my car that was parked at the Tashichhodzong government office complex. It could have hit any car, but no golfers bothered to come down and look for it, nor did they have concern of who/what was hit by the off-route golf ball. Perhaps they were looking for the 19th hole. now they have found the 19th hole in heaven-like Shinghar. But will they please the dieties? At least they disappointed me few years back.
-

118. Name: Joerg Stein on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: It is a shame and in my view absolutely contradicting the GNH philosophy building a golf course in such an environment! I was able to visit and experience Bhutan 2 years ago and was absolutely fascinated. Thus I incorporated the Main Opening Lecture at the 44th Annual Meeting of the Association of European Paediatric Cardiology held 2010 in Innsbruck to be given by Dasho Karma Ura on GNH as a highlight with a tremendous successful reaction of the participants! Keep Bhutan following this principles stay firm and do not get blended by short eyed easy profit offers which will only destroy your society's balance!
- 
119. Name: Anonymous on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
120. Name: Marni Kerseboom on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
121. Name: Karin Altmann on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
122. Name: Tandin Wangdi on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Let Shingkar maintain the freshness of nature, cohesiveness of culture and the sanctity for spiritual wellbeing. Let us not tint it.
- 
123. Name: Yeshey Wangdi on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I am not against with the golf lover. But I am bit concern with the nature of shingkar. What benefit the golf will provide to the communities of shingkar. Infect this will pollute the source of water and pollution of the environment.....
- 
124. Name: June Younger on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: The preservation of this valley is essential . There would be no benefit to the local people, in fact they would lose some farmland.
- 
125. Name: Viktoria Stein on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
126. Name: Rinzin Lhamo on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I am a very good friend of Choki Wangmo who is from shingkar...I have heard a lot of beautiful stories of her village from her...I know it is a religious place, very pure and sacred...and also being a bhutanese i should be responsible to protect our environment...so I am completely against the proposal to build golf course in Shingkar...&quot;say No To This Disaster&quot;....
- 
127. Name: Anonymous on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I support this petition on not to have golf court in Shingkar, Ura.
- 
128. Name: Lyn Dubowitz on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
129. Name: Vivienne Lo on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
130. Name: Carole McGranahan on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
131. Name: Tony Surtees on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Why spoil such a pristine valley? Do not yield to commercial temptation. Maintain peace and harmony within the country. The effects of a golf course may produce a financial gain in the short term but will be disastrous to the wild life and natural surrounds in the long term.  
  
T.S 29.07.2011
- 
132. Name: Kerstin Grothmann on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
-

133. Name: Anna Kuppuswamy on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
134. Name: Carol Blackett-Smith on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: Having visited Bhutan and enjoyed the beauty of nearby valley of Ura, I support the petition. Golf is an elitist and exclusive sport for the wealthy.  
Sincerely,  
Carol Blackett-Smith
- 
135. Name: Maybe Jehu on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments:
- 
136. Name: Ngodrup Dorjee on Jul 28, 2011  
Comments: I am totally baffled and shocked to learn of the proposal for a golf course in Shingkar. Bhutan has successfully lobbied the UN General Assembly to adopt GNH as an indicator of a country's success. A Golf course in Shingkar just does not sit comfortably with the view of Gross National happiness. Please ditch this proposal immediately!
- 
137. Name: Namgay Wangchuck on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: I had the same stand and i second the author.
- 
138. Name: Zoltan on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: I visited Ura this year and I am sure this place would not need a golf course. Neither would tourists need such a thing who do not come to Bhutan to play golf. On the contrary.  
  
When I volunteered in Bhutan I played football many times with local guys. This is a democratic sport, for instance, that connects people - unlike golf. Golf only connects a few rich at the expense of locals and the nature. Have you ever seen someone from the local village play golf in a nearby course? No, he can only serve drinks to privileged visitors at the club.  
Say no to golf and rather help develop lucrativ projects that are aligned with Bhutan's culture and traditions.
- 
139. Name: Sonam Thinley on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: convinced by your letter and i too oppose the proposal.
- 
140. Name: Kristel Josel on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: I have read about the project of building a golf course in Shingkar. Please consider the following: a golf course alone can never bring economic revenue. There will be a resort ,a country club and more and the only people who will have a possible benefit are the investors. Bhutan is known all over the world as a country that keeps its traditions high, it is a unique destination for those who want to experience the culture and wonders of nature and of sustainable way of life in its authentic form: why build a new golf course in this paradise?Bumthang's plains and pastures should stay as they are, pestizides and chemicals are a neccessity on a golf course and will affect the soil and enviroment of the whole valley. Golf is a seasonal experience in Bhutan's climate, the world is covered with golf resorts in all year round destinations. Why not improve the services and the maintanance of the Royal Thimpu Golf Club, historically grown into the country's capital with its breathtaking surroundings: a possible highlight and an exotic experience for every golfer who is on a cultural tour in Bhutan!!  
Kristel Josel, manager of the Union Golf Club Schloss Ernegg,Austria and partner of Bhutanese tour agents
- 
141. Name: Karma Ura on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Please read Dialogue from the Future under blog for comments
- 
142. Name: Tshering Phuntsho on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: I say BIG NO to Golf Course. The reason being the marshy land will get dried and will face water problem in long run.  
  
Please think before Action....
- 
143. Name: Tenzin Norbu on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: I am totally in motion to this letter enclosed by Dr. Karma Phuntsho. Thought i am not a resident of this serene village.
- 
144. Name: Benson Branch on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: I have been to Bhutan twice and feel that the golf course is inappropriate.
- 
145. Name: Ugyen on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Please keep the place as it is now.



- 
146. Name: Bruce Huett on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Although the proposal might have some economic benefits to the area I agree that the natural resources required to sustain a golf course and the impact on a potentially fragile eco system and local biodiversity indicate that this proposal is not a good idea for the local area or the country as a whole. The attraction of Bhutan from my visits is the fact that it has managed, in a unique fashion, to successfully preserve its natural environment (in marked contrast to some of its neighbours). Long may it continue.
- 
147. Name: Lisina M. Hoch on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Do not destroy the beauty of Shingkar with a golf course.
- 
148. Name: Phunthso on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: i am totally against having a golf course at Shingkar. we don't want shingkar to be a entertaining place which will have negative impact to the culture, ecological, and economic of the village. it time for all the shingkarpas to come together to stop having a golf course at Shingkar.
- 
149. Name: Friends Of Tibet on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
150. Name: Anonymous on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
151. Name: Ugyen on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
152. Name: Dorjee on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Common folks, let the people of Shingkar decide! This is democracy. Who are we to deny a local community their right to economic and material development? They have already preserved the spiritual heritage for well over 1200 years. A golfcourse is a revertable development! Take action against industries, roads and hydropower projects instead! Just make sure they keep ownership of the land, and make it a community-based project, so that the Shingkarpa also benefit from it.
- 
153. Name: Dawa on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: why to destroy such a beautiful place just for the silly idea of a golf course?. so a big NO !!
- 
154. Name: Sonam Wangdi on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
155. Name: Lhawang Dema on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Shingkar is one the tourist hot spot for its natural scenery and cool atmosphere, it is also considered as one of the sacred place where most of the Bhutanese deity visited there and the local people they worship this place. Bhutan just a developing country, golf market is not really in practice. Not many people enjoy such things. I say its not appropriate to for golf course in Shingkar.
- 
156. Name: Pema Wangdi on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
157. Name: Kuenzang Chhodon on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
158. Name: Lhaden Wangmo on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:
- 
159. Name: Namgyel Dema on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments: Bhutan should preserve Shingkar's pastoral beauty which signifies cultural & spiritual attraction not only to the bhutanese people but amazing site for the foreigners or tourists visiting our Country. So its an earnest request not to make this serene place a golf course.
- 
160. Name: Kelly Hawkins on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:

---

161. Name: Tshering Wangchuk on Jul 29, 2011  
Comments:

---

162. Name: Nancy Lin on Jul 30, 2011  
Comments:

---

163. Name: Sonam Younten on Jul 30, 2011  
Comments: Let the Shangri-La be.....

---

164. Name: Thinley Tshering on Jul 30, 2011  
Comments:

---

165. Name: Anonymous on Jul 30, 2011  
Comments:

---

166. Name: LHAWANG CHOZOM on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments:

---

167. Name: Karma Dorji on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments:

---

168. Name: Barbara Paterson on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: A golf course in Bhutan would not increase national happiness one bit!

---

169. Name: Phuntsho on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: Thanks Dr. Karma phuntsho for bringing up this issue and petition.

i was totally against this at the beginning itself. with my villagers i have discussed the matter and in fact they too are now happy with it.

i have also raised lots of concerns through media but the media people fail to include all the comments that i have made.

what so ever i am totally against this and hope that government will do away with this crazy idea.

---

170. Name: Teo Leng Yen on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments:

---

171. Name: Rinzin Wangmo on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: Why do we use away our Children's Inheritance?  
Leave Shinghar village alone!!

---

172. Name: Chhoden Tshering on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments:

---

173. Name: Jennifer Corr on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: For this golf course to go ahead would be a great shame.

---

174. Name: Peter Keddie on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: Do the local people have first right of play; I dont expect they do... golf did not seem a top sport in Bhutan, so why sacrifice such a treasured area for foreigners... try to localise any damage from tourism I say...

---

175. Name: Karen Lang on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments:

---

176. Name: Sonam Youden on Jul 31, 2011

Comments:

- 
177. Name: Tshering Wangdi on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: Lets keep up with the constitution on conservation of nature. Serenity is seldom found
- 
178. Name: John Patrick on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: I loved Bhutan during my visit because it was everything one needed, endless beauty, people with contentment and well-being and tourism that was different, it was a country with its own values and identity. Avoid traps like developing golf as a tourist attraction, the new huge buddha is sufficient grotesqueness for the country!
- 
179. Name: Kelzang Dorjee on Jul 31, 2011  
Comments: F\*\*K all the golfers&quot;
- 
180. Name: Sonamt on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: This is how elites grab farmers' lands and slowly evict them from their ancestral villages to out on the streets.  
  
Anyone petitioning against the land grab near GNH center in Bumthang? At least to enable the farmers to have their say on their land in hindsight.
- 
181. Name: Judith Pollock on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: What a shame it would be to spoil such a beautiful valley. Bhutan would lose some of its natural charm if a golf course was constructed in the area.
- 
182. Name: Anonymous on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
183. Name: Tandin on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: I am against this proposal...  
The whole national should be
- 
184. Name: Ydeet Winter-Irving on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
185. Name: Ian Magowan on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: Having recently visited Bhutan and the nearby Ura Valley I have great difficulty in comprehending how anyone could think of compromising 3-4 centuries of tightly knitted communal self-sufficiency with the promise of serfdom to an alien entity....as to the golfing tourist trade that is here the subject of concern. The life of subsistence farming which I observed appeared to be hard and but then again the full-some community spirit I perceived was obvious everywhere....to even me as a sojourner.  
I understand the appeal that the marketing glitz will have for young people and I despair for you ....particularly in this case where there is the potential of subjugation of the landscape and of the welfare of an entire community.  
I don't have to tell you this, but beware of foreign dept, credit deals(becomes the same thing), and foreign ownership of land.
- 
186. Name: Yangchi Pema on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
187. Name: Joana Cotar on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
188. Name: Kezang Lhamo Dorji on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
189. Name: Anonymous on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
190. Name: Gyembo Gyeltshen on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: Please Help Save the Environment  
=D

- 
191. Name: Maria Kintzli on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
192. Name: Bridget Parslow on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: I would agree with Dr Phuntsho's views on the importance of retaining the spiritual, cultural and environmental tranquility of the valley as it currently is
- 
193. Name: Anonymous on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: m against it ....
- 
194. Name: Heidi Fjeld on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: Please stop this project. Sacred landscapes are too important to be destroyed for another golf course in the world.
- 
195. Name: Annie Vickers on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: Please consider the culture of this beautiful country and its people. A golfcourse is totally unnecessary here.
- 
196. Name: Merle Lovelock on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: The main reason I visited Bhutan was because it is unspoilt, I would have been disappointed to have seen a golf course. I also think a golf course would stop most tourists from visiting.
- 
197. Name: Dr. Tashi Jyatsho on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: We should not build a golf course in Shikgkhar!!
- 
198. Name: Michael J Vickers on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
199. Name: Peter Wanten on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: I have been in Bhutan in April. Why disrupt this Valley with a Golf Couxe? Please let Bhutan stay what is is: A beautiful country with buddhistic values!  
Thanka a lot for your understanding!
- 
200. Name: Laszlo Zsolnai on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: It is a very destructive project in such an area. Also, the project violates the principles of Gross National Happiness. It should not be implemented.
- 
201. Name: Phuntsok Rabten on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments:
- 
202. Name: Thomas Gerl on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: Save the beauty of the landscape. it won't come back once it is destroyed.
- 
203. Name: Bridget Patrick on Aug 01, 2011  
Comments: As a recent visitor to Bhutan in May 2011 I can only express concern that such a pristine environment as the Shingkhar Valley should potentially be spoiled by the creation of a golf course. Bhutan should be proud that it has retained so many aspects of its heritage both environmental and cultural. I would respectfully suggest that careful consideration be given to allowing large scale tourist attractions, such as the golf course, to be constructed in Bhutan. The very core of the reasons visitors to Bhutan value their experiences travelling through Bhutan will be threatened.
- 
204. Name: Rinchen Wangchuk on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: I fully support Dr. Karma Phuntsho. Thanks for your great concern, we all appreciate your work that has awakened everywhere throughout the reach of media online. Actually some of us already discussed tried to gather views and snesitize all the citizens of Shingkhar esp. the educated lot through a group net work on Facebook but there was not much participation. Also recently I heard through the news collectors where the news is already published and even reinstated saying nixed by MoAF that one or two scapegoats of our villagers were gruelling to make bounty earnings inviting such rural tourism related project investors and trying to hack all the common assets of community for the individual benefits destabilizing the community unity by forming groups. We are very happy for your prior concern and informing us. Lets make networks of concerns and strongly support our very sacredly gifted motherland resources. Lhagyalo!!!
-

205. Name: Robin Peter Tensen on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments:
- 
206. Name: Needrup Zangpo on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments:
- 
207. Name: Anonymous on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments:
- 
208. Name: Vic Conran on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: i do not agree with the development of a golf course. this will not benefit local people. it will destroy extraordinary natural beauty. Please consider this action as utter folly and do not proceed.
- 
209. Name: Heike Bielefeld on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: Please secure this wonderful natur and landscape of Buthan. Many thanks.
- 
210. Name: Dr.med. Harald Lucius on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: No golf-course in Bhutan, ther's no need for that, it will only invite all those millionaires and sex-less idiots that have stopped living
- 
211. Name: Astrid Hovden on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments:
- 
212. Name: Anonymous on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: No!
- 
213. Name: Jerry Gibson on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: Bhutan doesnt need a golf course. Land is limited and far too precious in Bhutan to allow it to be wasted for the benefit of a few elitists.
- 
214. Name: Annita Moey on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: I support this cause
- 
215. Name: Rob Chant on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments: Although I have never been to the area, I vote strongly against the creation of something as crass as a new golf course. Why can the area not simply be left alone?
- 
216. Name: Chimi on Aug 02, 2011  
Comments:
- 
217. Name: Steve Hogan on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments: I love golf but having lived in Thimphu and played golf regularly on the local course do not think that another course would be of any benefit to the country and people of Bhutan.
- 
218. Name: Yiga on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments: Writing in support of this petition, may a more suitable place be found for this golfing venture rather than in the beautiful Shingkhhar valley for the many reasons outlined.
- 
219. Name: Jean Timsit on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments:
- 
220. Name: Belinda Winter-Irving And Paul E. Mason on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments:
- 
221. Name: Belinda Winter-Irving And Paul E. Mason on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments:
-

222. Name: Sabine Flores Sotomayor on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments: Please save the qualities of buddhism culture. Golf sports isabsolutely unessential.
- 
223. Name: Carlos Fernández Bourgon on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments: ; Save tha Nature !
- 
224. Name: Sonam Rinzin on Aug 03, 2011  
Comments: Development is inevitable but if the people of bhutan do not take care of what is now theirs, outsiders will be pleased to turn our whole country into a business machine... Leave Bhutan alone...
- 
225. Name: Dorji Dukpa on Aug 04, 2011  
Comments: Don't spoil the mother nature. Please keep it as it. Let the nature takes its own place.
- 
226. Name: Dorji Penjore on Aug 06, 2011  
Comments: I support the concerns raised by Dr Karma Phuntsho.
- 
227. Name: Dorji Penjore on Aug 06, 2011  
Comments: I support the concerns raised by Dr Karma Phuntsho.
- 
228. Name: J Maki on Aug 07, 2011  
Comments:
- 
229. Name: Damber Mani Rai on Aug 09, 2011  
Comments: Enough is enough, it is time one should stop exploiting our printine environment. Let it remain in its natural state for generation.
- 
230. Name: Helen Lambert on Aug 09, 2011  
Comments:
- 
231. Name: Andreas Wieser on Aug 09, 2011  
Comments:
- 
232. Name: Robert Fletcher on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: I would amend the statement to change Culturally,&quot; if there is one sport which can be associated with the materialist and elitist Western culture, it would be golf. &quot; by deleting 'western' as Asians are the big golk players. It should read &quot;Culturally, if there is one sport which can be associated with the materialist and elitist culture, it would be golf.&quot;
- 
233. Name: Robert Fletcher on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: I would amend the statement to change Culturally,&quot; if there is one sport which can be associated with the materialist and elitist Western culture, it would be golf. &quot; by deleting 'western' as Asians are the big golk players. It should read &quot;Culturally, if there is one sport which can be associated with the materialist and elitist culture, it would be golf.&quot;
- 
234. Name: Christine Pearson on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Hope this petition succeeds. We also need to get rid of the proposed airport in the east.
- 
235. Name: Mary Jose on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Places such as this of spiritual and cultural importance should be presereved. There are many other places for goldf courses and investment can be sensitive and without large environmental impacts.
- 
236. Name: Val Jessop on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: please save the valley
- 
237. Name: Jackie Lynch on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Bhutan's physical, cultural and spiritual are what makes it the last Shangri-La .... how does a golf course enhance this ????
- 
238. Name: Mike Taverner on Aug 10, 2011

Comments: We need to value and protect pristine environments and societies such as this

---

239. Name: Marilyn Sykes on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: This beautiful area should not be destroyed by a golf course!!!!
- 
240. Name: Meredith Hinchliffe on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Please don't spoil this pristine and beautiful valley with a golf course
- 
241. Name: Jennie Roberts on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Chasing the tourist dollar at the expense of the natural Bhutanese environment. A tragedy!
- 
242. Name: Geoff Paul on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
243. Name: Alison Hanson on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: PLease take notice of this petition , I agree with it wholeheartedly.
- 
244. Name: Anonymous on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: this would be an ecological disaster
- 
245. Name: Joy Hetherington on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
246. Name: Rosslyn Kemp on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
247. Name: Dr. Roland Berger on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
248. Name: Jigme Tandin Peljor on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Our unique land, identity is declining every day, month n year. So it is the duty of the Bhutanese citezens to take care of it rather than eroding with other works. As a responsible citizen So i strongly oppose of launching Golf course. Plz we beg u to stop making plans before things become to difficult to tolerate. So we will not have to live in sad stage henceforth. thanks for viewing my comments.
- 
249. Name: Anita Meyer, Switzerland on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Please don't &quot;sell out&quot; your beautiful contry just for a shortliving incentive of &quot;quick money&quot;!
- 
250. Name: Maureen Mutton on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments: Protect this beautiful spiritual place. say no to a golf course.
- 
251. Name: Amely Haslauer on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
252. Name: Carole Kokinis on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
253. Name: Jane Elliot on Aug 10, 2011  
Comments:
- 
254. Name: G Wilde on Aug 11, 2011  
Comments: Too many wild places are being destroyed for golf courses for a few wealthy.
- 
255. Name: Katherine And Richard Heery on Aug 11, 2011  
Comments:

- 
256. Name: Suzanne Buckle on Aug 11, 2011  
Comments: As a tour guide to Asian destinations for the last 15 years I would not support a golf course which provides benefit to such a small, select group. In my experience promoting cultural tourism - that is promoting the natural beauty of your area and the cultural heritage of its people is a much more sustainable option for developing tourism. This safeguards local traditions and encourages all local people to be involved and therefore everyone benefits in the long term. Yours is a unique environment - golf courses are everywhere so there would be many more choices for golf tourists. Why not develop walking, trekking and cycling tourism - so many are interested in tourism that shows them the real character of the country.
- 
257. Name: Judith O'Hagan on Aug 12, 2011  
Comments:
- 
258. Name: Mrs Sophie Bonsor And Family on Aug 12, 2011  
Comments:
- 
259. Name: Barbara Brend on Aug 12, 2011  
Comments:
- 
260. Name: Susan Rathbone on Aug 12, 2011  
Comments: Please do not spoil such a beautiful valley. People who come to Bhutan come for peace and serenity and not to play golf. They go to Portugal for that.
- 
261. Name: Kenneth Gibbs on Aug 12, 2011  
Comments: It would seem sensible to promote tourism to all parts of Bhutan while maintaining the cultural heritage which marks it out as so different. If Bhutanese tour guides can be trained to present everything that is of so much value to the society in their well known gentle manner, I am sure that not only will Bhutan attract many more visitors that it does presently, but it will preserve the identity of the country. I strongly recommend that the proposal for a golf course here be declined.
- 
262. Name: Boffy Delmotte on Aug 13, 2011  
Comments: Buthan is a wonderful country and doesn't need a golf course
- 
263. Name: Anonymous on Aug 13, 2011  
Comments: Please keep your beautiful country and ways of life as traditional as possible. I appreciate modern conveniences make life easy and support their introduction. Golf courses even in the west are exclusive and I understand many struggle as a business. Please question why golf courses are essential to tourism in Bhutan. I enjoyed my stay in Bhutan last year and plan to return to the peace and tranquillity.
- 
264. Name: Dinah Swayne on Aug 13, 2011  
Comments: Although a keen supporter of golf in the right place, I am opposed to disrupting the spiritual and pastoral valley. Please don't allow this development. I wholeheartedly support the petition.
- 
265. Name: John Clark on Aug 13, 2011  
Comments: What a ludicrous proposal in such a place. Presumably travel writers and therefore planners are hoping to make money out of the top end of the tourist market to avoid mass tourism & one must have some sympathy with that view. There are other way to do that .Putting in a golf course will merely attract those wealthy golfers who collect courses around the world as trophies, ticking them off without any thought for the country they are in and its infrastructure
- 
266. Name: John Clark on Aug 13, 2011  
Comments: What a ludicrous proposal in such a place. Presumably travel writers and therefore planners are hoping to make money out of the top end of the tourist market to avoid mass tourism & one must have some sympathy with that view. There are other way to do that .Putting in a golf course will merely attract those wealthy golfers who collect courses around the world as trophies, ticking them off without any thought for the country they are in and its infrastructure
- 
267. Name: John Clark on Aug 13, 2011  
Comments: What a ludicrous proposal in such a place. Presumably travel writers and therefore planners are hoping to make money out of the top end of the tourist market to avoid mass tourism & one must have some sympathy with that view. There are other way to do that .Putting in a golf course will merely attract those wealthy golfers who collect courses around the world as trophies, ticking them off without any thought for the country they are in and its infrastructure
- 
268. Name: Leesa Constantine on Aug 14, 2011



Comments: please dont ruin this natural beautiful valley

---

269. Name: Caroline McCowen on Aug 14, 2011  
Comments: To allow the development of a golf course in this beautiful vally, or anywhere in Bhutan, would drive a large nail in the coffin of Bhutan's traditional way of life and spiritual heritage. Bhutan does not need such western materialistic ventures; it will do only harm to the local people, and rob them of values which they have so far kept, in spite of increasing openness to the Western culture.
- 
270. Name: Anonymous on Aug 14, 2011  
Comments: Whole-heartedly agree with the letter here. Please preserve the natural, spiritual beauty of this valley. That will allow the locals to continue their lives uninterrupted and tourists will also flock to see this beautiful valley. For me and many of my friends and fellow travellers a big attraction of Bhutan is that there are no big resorts, golf courses or McDonalds. People can play golf in Thailand - let Bhutan be different, unique and beautiful. The last Shangrila.
- 
271. Name: Colin Lipson on Aug 14, 2011  
Comments:
- 
272. Name: Colin Lipson on Aug 14, 2011  
Comments:
- 
273. Name: Mrs Katherine Veronica Clegg on Aug 14, 2011  
Comments: I am appaled that such a thing as a golf course should be built in this beautiful valley, Bhutan is such a special place and have been so careful, so far, to preserve their uniqueness, a golf course is completely out of place and will do their 'specialness' no end of harm and send out a completely wrong message.
- 
274. Name: Peter Ibbotson on Aug 14, 2011  
Comments: Please think twice before destroying beauty and tranquillity that cannot be replaced.
- 
275. Name: Sally Jakobi on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments: This is a wonderful area and a very sacred place. There are enough golf courses in the world but far too few places like this!!!
- 
276. Name: Pamela Harris on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments: I have recently returned from a visit to this beautiful unspoilt country, and am very opposed to the creation of this golf course.
- 
277. Name: ANNE JAGO on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:
- 
278. Name: John BILLINGTON on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments: The idea is deplorable. Local people will not benefit ; a golf course will attract the wrong sort of people and behaviour and is in conflict with essential Bhutanese values. Bhutan's culture is unique and valuable but it is also fragile. What next? Casinos? The Las Vegas of the Himalayas ? I urge the authorities to think again and stop this inappropriate development.
- 
279. Name: Mr Edward Coales on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments: Having visited Bhutan this year I understand why this project will be an ecological disaster.
- 
280. Name: Dr And Mrs R Martin on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:
- 
281. Name: Roger Newson on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:
- 
282. Name: Elizabeth Gibbs on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:
- 
283. Name: Ursula Scheidle on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:

- 
284. Name: Ursula Scheidle on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:
- 
285. Name: Viktor Bruckman on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments: Do not touch this unique landscape!
- 
286. Name: Sabine Kriechbaum on Aug 15, 2011  
Comments:
- 
287. Name: Anonymous on Aug 16, 2011  
Comments: What craziness! Will we ever stop destroying the nest in which we live!
- 
288. Name: Sue Byrne on Aug 16, 2011  
Comments: You have a very precious land please don't lay waste to it for a few privileged people who want to hit a ball around.
- 
289. Name: Patricia Wager on Aug 16, 2011  
Comments: A golf course in Bhutan will not add to GDH!
- 
290. Name: Anne Dawnay on Aug 16, 2011  
Comments: Innapropriate for Bhutan's pristine landscape and would put us off visiting.
- 
291. Name: Bharti Patel on Aug 16, 2011  
Comments:
- 
292. Name: Susan Chapman on Aug 17, 2011  
Comments: One of the beauties of your country will be spoilt with western ideas. Therefore I am against.
- 
293. Name: Elizabeth Chatwin on Aug 18, 2011  
Comments: A golf course is not progress, it is a waste of good, and in this case, holy land, a playground for the rich,& unecological to the landscape.
- 
294. Name: Lucy Hobhouse on Aug 20, 2011  
Comments:
- 
295. Name: Andras Darabant on Aug 21, 2011  
Comments:
- 
296. Name: Anonymous on Aug 21, 2011  
Comments:
- 
297. Name: Valerie Marriott on Aug 22, 2011  
Comments: Bhutan is such a beautiful country, one of the lasat unspoilt places in the world. Please treasure it.
- 
298. Name: Christine Potocnik on Aug 23, 2011  
Comments:
- 
299. Name: Allan L Bayliss on Aug 23, 2011  
Comments: My wife and I have visited Bhutan, attracted by its people and its unspoilt rural landscape. A golf course in this valley would be a disincentive to travellers such as ourselves.
- 
300. Name: Chris And John Woulds on Aug 25, 2011  
Comments:
- 
301. Name: Mrs Celia Randell on Aug 26, 2011

Comments: Bhutan should be leading the world in its environmental policy as it is so uniquely unspoilt . A golf course would give a clear message to visitors and the Bhutanese people that environmental issues don't apply to the rich and that the ways of the west should be aspired to. They should not!

---

302. Name: Elaine Chapman on Aug 27, 2011  
Comments:

---

303. Name: Alison Tay on Sep 06, 2011  
Comments:

---

304. Name: Karina Moreton on Sep 08, 2011  
Comments:

---

305. Name: Karina Moreton on Sep 08, 2011  
Comments:

---

306. Name: Karina Moreton on Sep 08, 2011  
Comments:

---

307. Name: Karina Moreton on Sep 08, 2011  
Comments:

---

308. Name: Karina Moreton on Sep 08, 2011  
Comments:

---

309. Name: James Moreton on Sep 08, 2011  
Comments:

---

310. Name: Olly Reston on Sep 09, 2011  
Comments:

---

311. Name: J Maki on Sep 13, 2011  
Comments:

---

312. Name: Tshering Dekyi on Sep 13, 2011  
Comments:

---

313. Name: Aileen Maki on Sep 13, 2011  
Comments: Please leave the beautiful land of Shingkar free of a golf course that would benefit few, yet cost so many so much.

---

314. Name: Lhaden Wangmo on Sep 20, 2011  
Comments:

---

315. Name: Ashlyn Armour-Brown on Sep 21, 2011  
Comments:

---

316. Name: Eva Scharf on Sep 26, 2011  
Comments:

---

317. Name: Yuvaree Phakdiakson on Oct 03, 2011  
Comments: There will always be another solution to go for the economic gain without risking the natural & cultural resources.

---

318. Name: Rainer Roesshuber on Oct 05, 2011  
Comments:

---

319. Name: Phub Tenzin on Oct 06, 2011  
Comments: The learned has to tell the locales if this golf course is an answer to their livelihood. Letting them make the final decision is democratically perfect but we know that our people in the villages can be easily lured for any minute economic gains. I personally find it imperative and deemed for those of us-outside the realm to make a united effort to say a big NO for the project .
- 
320. Name: Anonymous on Oct 25, 2011  
Comments: I totally support saying No to gulf course in Shingkar. I have visited Bhutan several times and it would be a pity to destroy this valley just for a gulf course.
- 
321. Name: Tshewang Dema on Nov 08, 2011  
Comments: I support Dr Karma Phuntsho's views too.
- 
322. Name: Einrad on Nov 13, 2011  
Comments: insane, pls stop it!!!!!!
- 
323. Name: Ayo Oum Shanti on Dec 06, 2011  
Comments: I fell in love with Shingkar on my first trip to Bhutan and the experience there was the major source of my transformation. Shingkar is beautiful on so many levels, and a golf course in the middle of it would severely diminish all that Shingkar has to offer.
-

## The Shingkhar solar project is a great initiative but for a different location

The recent media report about a major solar project of some 80000 panels covering over 100 acres of Shingkhar's Kangsumthang pastures is a disturbing news. In 2011, a golf course project on the same spot was withdrawn for ecological, social, and cultural reasons. The Ministry of Agriculture and Forests and the National Land Commission at that time stopped the golf course saying the meadow is an important wetland and community pasture.

The Kangsumthang meadow not only serves as watershed and village commons but has spiritual and cultural significance being part of the sacred landscape covering the holy sites of Dechenling, Rinchen Jungney and Shamzur. Stating these reasons, the villagers (34 out of 39 households) submitted a petition to the Gewog office to cancel the solar project. Aware of the project's national benefit, they suggested the spacious highlands from Rethang to Ngamdung for the project as these places have even better sunlight and are far from the village.

It appears that the project is funded by ABD and ADB clearly has safeguard policies for both environment and indigenous people recognizing their cultural integrity and their rights to ancestral land and resources. The locals of Shingkhar have voiced their concerns that their livelihood through dairy farming and tourism will be seriously affected by the project. Is the project viable, then, and can it succeed with such local resistance?

As a well travelled researcher, I can vouch that Shingkhar remains as one of the few beautiful valleys in Bhutan with serene and sacred landscape not marred by chaotic development. I dread to think how 80000 solar panels covering an area equivalent to some 70 football fields would disfigure Shingkhar's landscape of green meadows, holy sites and an idyllic village. No doubt we must support a sustainable renewable energy project of national importance but do we have to use such a sacred and ecological site for it? Could the local suggestion to use the upper reaches of the valley offer a better and more effective venue for project? One can only hope that the project realizes with minimum impact on nature and culture in the true spirit of GNH and find a win-win situation for both the nation and the local community.

